



## PLANNING AND BUDGETING COUNCIL (PBC) MEETING MINUTES

**Present:** Mike Bush (*co-chair*), Linda Kama'ila (*co-chair*), Robert Cabral, Marlene Dean, Ishita Edwards, Alex Lynch, Tom O'Neil, Leo Orange, Mike Abram, Daniel Goicoechea (proxy from Ralph Smith), Ana Maria Valle, Jeanette Redding, Jeff Hiben, Lisa Hopper, Karen Engelsen, Carolyn Inouye, Juan Smith-Valle (*ASG Rep*), Linda Robison, Erika Endrijonas (*ex-officio*)

**Absent:** Ralph Smith (proxy to Daniel Goicoechea)

**Guests:** Jim Merrill, Jonas Crawford, Christiane Mainzer, Karla Banks, Gail Warner, Carmen Guerrero, Mati Sanchez, Connie Campos, Kevin Hughes, C. Horrock, Christina Tafoya, Bola King-Rushing

---

Meeting Date: **09/26/2012**      Minutes Approved: **09/19/12**      Recorded By: Darlene Inda

---

**AN = Action Needed    AT = Action Taken    D = Discussion    I = Information Only**

---

### **DISCUSSION/DECISIONS**

- |                    |  |
|--------------------|--|
| I. Called to Order | I      The meeting was called to order at 2:04 p.m.  |
| II. Public Comment | I      J. Merrill stated that the agenda was not properly posted in accordance to the Brown Act so this body cannot take action or deliberate. M. Bush responded that we can hold a special meeting with a 24-hour notice and can exchange information today with no deliberation and schedule a meeting to take action. All were in agreement to deliver their information individually with no deliberation and decided to hold a special meeting to take action on September 26, 2012 at 2:00p.m. The location is to be determined. |
|                    | I      It was noted that D. Goicoechea was given proxy again by R. Smith and L. Kamaila stated that he can attend one more meeting he misses one more meeting his seat will become vacant and go to someone else.  |
|                    | I      J. Redding asked about possibly having two more meetings so that we can address the instructional and non-instructional side of the house for reductions. K. Engelsen responded that if there is any information this committee would like to know from Student Services to assist with making non-instructional decisions, to let her know. M. Bush responded that the requests can be sent to either him or L. Kamaila.   |

- |  |   |   |
|--|---|---|
| III. Approval of Meeting Minutes       | I | Will review and approve at next meeting.  |
| IV. Discontinuance of Engineering Tech | I | Will discuss and take action at the next meeting.   |
| V. Program Recommendations Worksheet   | I | Unable to take action at meeting, but committee decided that each person would present their information alphabetically with no deliberation and that action will be taken at the next meeting.   |
|  | I | <p>M. Abrams presented his recommendations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dental Hygiene – highest cost FTE, low Hispanic members not serving, no jobs in the community.</li> <li>• Dental Assisting – 2<sup>nd</sup> highest FTE, low number of students in comparison to other programs, not serving local community compared to other programs.</li> <li>• Television – high FTE cost as well as graduates do not get jobs locally.</li> <li>• Personal Guidance – high FTE cost, low number of students, no transfer, and questions about productivity.</li> <li>• ESL – reduce \$100K. Program is very important, but non-transferrable.</li> </ul> |
|  | I | R. Cabral stated that he took a different approach when coming up with his recommendations; he took into consideration what students are using to get in and out, so he used the catalog and looked at areas within the general education requirement and said that reductions should be made towards not offering so much. He spoke about the Foundation's vote to grant the college \$200K each year for the next five years to go towards programs, so when looking at reduction he really looked at \$600K in program reductions.   |
|  | I | <p>M. Dean began coming up with her recommendations starting with Dental Hygiene but couldn't continue because she didn't have enough information. M. Bush responded that if she has specific programs she needs more information on, he can send it to her.</p>  |
|  | I | <p>I. Edwards started by mentioning the cost factors when making her recommendations to reduce or temporarily suspend the following programs:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Dental Hygiene – funded with all grant funds it could access, Hispanic attendance in program, PEP report and only 30% of students who were in program had</li> </ul>   |

full-time jobs in 2010.

- Dental Assisting – lose very little in FTES
- Personal Guidance – low loss of FTES.
- Television – high cost per FTES, PEP reports, and courses are listed as transfer but only the unit's transfer, not the course.
- Auto Collision Repair.

I K. Engelsen made her recommendations and stated she thought about students and what they come here for and addressing their needs as well as consideration for the community.

- Dental Hygiene – high cost per student.
- Auto Technology – high cost per student and similar program at VC.
- Health Education – suspend. Not a core program and other community resources to fulfill the students.
- Television – high cost per student.
- Sign Language – eliminate. No degree or certificate.

I J. Hiben stated his recommendations:

- Engineering Tech – eliminate. Program offered itself for discontinuance.
- Personal Guidance – eliminate.
- Dental Hygiene – suspend.
- Dental Assisting – suspend.
- English – reduce 5 unit courses.

I L. Hopper stated her recommendations:

- Dental Assisting – suspend until resources are available.
- Music – eliminate or reduce – program at VC.
- Personal Guidance – suspend or eliminate. Establishment of freshmen experience and LLRC so a lot of services can work in with this.
- Television – eliminate or suspend. Not many awards nor have high level courses been offered in sometime and OCTV is gone.
- Sign Language – VC offers the 1st and 2<sup>nd</sup> levels.

I Carolyn Inouye stated her recommendations:

- Dental Hygiene – eliminate. High cost per FTES.
- Dental Assisting – suspend.
- Divisions and Departments should reduce their instructional budgets. She would rather reduce number of course offerings in selected areas and offer core.

- I A. Lynch stated his recommendations:
  - Engineering Tech
  - Dental Assisting
  - Dental Hygiene
  - Personal Guidance - reduce \$50K.
- I T. O'Neil stated his recommendations:
  - Dental Hygiene – eliminate
  - Dental Assisting – eliminate
  - Personal Guidance – suspend or eliminate
  - ESL – reduce
  - Television – reduce
- I L. Orange stated his recommendations:
  - Dental Hygiene – eliminate
  - Dental Assisting – eliminate
  - Television – suspend
- I J. Redding stated that as the AFT rep she cannot recommend elimination of any faculty but did her research and came up with the following recommendations on programs:
  - Dental Hygiene – suspend
  - Dental Assisting – suspend
  - Television – suspend
- I L. Robison stated she met with the Classified Supervisors and discussed programs and recommend:
  - Dental Hygiene – eliminate/suspend
  - Dental Assisting – eliminate/suspend
  - Television – eliminate
  - Personal Guidance – eliminate
  - Office Technology – eliminate
- I D. Goicoechea wanted it on the record that counseling does not want to eliminate any program period but they are forced to come up with recommendations.
  - Dental Hygiene – eliminate
  - Television – suspend
  - Sign Language – eliminate
  - English and Math – reduce in some type of capacity
- I J. Smith-Valle stated his recommendations and conveyed that these are not his personal recommendations, rather they are the recommendations of the students:
  - Dental Hygiene – eliminate/suspend
  - Dental Assisting – eliminate/suspend

- I A. Valle addressed each program and why it should be kept rather than discontinued. When making her decision she looked at CSU, General Ed, and Breadth. She made the following recommendations:
  - Dental Hygiene – eliminate
  - Dental Assisting – eliminate
  - Fire Technology Manager – abolish position
  - Sign Language - eliminate
  - Engineering Tech – eliminate
- VI. Accreditation
  - I M. Bush stated that Dr. Duran sent out an email regarding accreditation today and he recommended everyone review it.
- VII. Adjournment
  - I The meeting adjourned at 4:23 p.m.
- VIII. Future PBC Meeting
  - September 26, 2012
  - October 17, 2012
  - November 21, 2012
  - January 16, 2013
  - February 20, 2013
  - March 20, 2013
  - April 17, 2013